

SPECIAL USE PERMIT

Case Coordinator: Michael McCauley

GENERAL PROJECT INFORMATION

SITE ZONING: PD-189 for the (O-4) Office District.

SURROUNDING ZONING

SURROUNDING LAND USES

NORTH	PD-189 for the (O-4) Office District	Undeveloped
SOUTH	PD-189 for the (O-4) Office District	Hotel (Courtyard by Marriott)
EAST	(SF-8.4/16) Single-Family Residential	Residential Subdivision (Nob Hill across McCoy Road)
WEST	PD-05 for the (LR-2) Local Retail District	Home Improvement Store (Lowe's)

REQUEST: Approval of a Special Use Permit to allow a Residence Hotel

PROPOSED USE: Residence Hotel

ACRES/LOTS: Approximately 4.6 acres / 1 Lot

LOCATION: Approximately 800 feet north of E. Trinity Mills Road, between Raiford and McCoy Roads

HISTORY: PD-189 was established in 2010.

The property is not platted.

The property is currently undeveloped.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN: Multi-Family Residential

TRANSPORTATION PLAN: Raiford Road is designated as a (C4U) 4-Lane Undivided Collector (TOD Area) and McCoy Road is designated as a (C2U) 2-Lane Undivided Collector.

OWNER: Lowen Allen, LP

REPRESENTED BY: James Lusty / Type Six

STAFF ANALYSIS

PROPOSAL

The applicant is requesting approval of a SUP to establish a Residence Hotel (Residence Inn Carrollton).

CURRENT ZONING – PLANNED DEVELOPMENT 189

1. The PD allows full-service and limited-service hotels by right unless located within 300 feet of McCoy Road and south of Sutters Mill Drive. However, a residence hotel or hotel suites require a SUP.
2. Because the hotel is 6 stories, the hotel must be located a minimum of 200 feet from McCoy Road, measured from the back of the existing curb. *The proposed hotel is located 200 feet from McCoy Road.*
3. The PD requires a minimum 100-foot wide conservation buffer measured from the back of the existing curb of McCoy Road to be maintained in a natural state. *The buffer remains the same and undisturbed with the new hotel.*
4. The PD requires a landscape buffer, averaging 15 feet in width, but no less than 5 feet minimum width at any point, alongside and abutting the conservation buffer adjacent to any private development. *The proposed landscape buffer averages 15 feet in width with no less than 5 feet in width at any point.*
5. The PD requires a mutual access and cross access between lots. *A mutual access is provided from the existing Courtyard Marriott Hotel.*
6. Only one driveway is permitted onto McCoy Road. *This has been carried-out by the hospital's driveway onto McCoy Road and aligns with Blackstone Drive. No other development shall have a driveway onto McCoy Road.*

ZONING ORDINANCE – ARTICLE XXI SPECIAL USE PERMITS

The following are some of the standards and criteria contained for Residence Hotels or Hotel Suites:

1. A weekly rate may be charged, and no monthly rate shall be charged. *The hotel charges daily rates similar to a full-service hotel and no minimum weekly or monthly stay is required.*
2. Must contain 90 or more guest rooms and accessed from an interior hallway. *The hotel will have a minimum 110 guest rooms.*
3. A porte-cochere or covered area must be provided immediately adjacent to the entrance with a registration desk. The porte-cochere or covered area must be sufficient in size to accommodate

the temporary parking of at least 2 vehicles parked side by side for guests checking in and out. *The hotel provides a porte-cochere adjacent to the entrance large enough for 2 vehicles parked side by side.*

4. Brick pavers shall be provided in all porte-cochere areas and main drive locations. *The residence hotel provides brick pavers under the porte-cochere and at the intersection with Raiford Road.*
5. Kitchenettes are allowed in rooms. *Hotel will have an upscale fully equipped kitchen with stainless steel appliances (dishwasher, refrigerator/freezer, range, and microwave) and utensils.*
6. Window PTAC units shall not project beyond the façade walls or any unit. *Meets requirement.*
7. The hotel is required to provide at least 2 amenities from the following list: *Applicant is providing over and above the four amenities.*
 - a. An indoor or outdoor swimming pool (*providing indoor pool*)
 - b. Weight room or fitness facility (*providing minimum 700 square feet*)
 - c. Business center (*providing minimum 850 square foot business center and meeting room*)
 - d. Sports court (*providing an outdoor sport court*)

Additional amenities:

- 1) 24-hour guest services staff
- 2) Daily housekeeping service
- 3) Daily hot breakfast
- 4) Sundry shop
- 5) Valet laundry service
- 6) Fully equipped kitchenettes with stainless steel appliances
- 7) Evening mixer

ELEMENTS TO CONSIDER

1. In 2008, the City Council approved the purchase of 110 acres of land generally located at the northeast corner of Old Denton Road and Raiford Road. This tract of land became known as the Raiford Road project area. From the start of the City's purchasing the 110 acres, it has been the City's objective to create a high-quality hotel development that emphasized sustainability.
2. In 2010, approximately 31 acres was sought out from the 110-acre project area north of the President George Bush Turnpike (PGBT) and between McCoy Road and Raiford Road and south of Furneaux Creek, to create a vision or masterplan for the area. Prior to establishing the PD, staff conducted 4 meetings with property owners and representatives of the Nob Hill

Subdivision (east of McCoy Road) to discuss the vision for this 31-acre tract. During the November 2, 2010 joint public hearing with the Planning & Zoning Commission and City Council, staff presented an outline for the 31-acre tract to accommodate office, hospitality and hotel uses, which included a proposal from the applicant for 3 internationally branded, high-quality, upscale hotels (Courtyard Marriott, Hampton Inn Hilton and Residence Inn Marriott) aligned along Raiford Road.

3. The tract was rezoned from (MF-15) Multi-Family Residential and (FWY) Freeway Districts to a Planned Development (PD-189) for the (O-4) Office District to regulate hotels and other uses while adding specific development restrictions, which are to remain in place. These specific development restrictions were adopted by Council after input from the neighborhoods to the east and after a public hearing. These restrictions are:
 - a. A 100' wide conservation "no build" buffer on the immediate west side of McCoy. The buffer is to be retained in a landscaped or natural state. Pedestrian/bike trails are allowed to cross the buffer area.
 - b. No driveway access is allowed to McCoy Road through the conservation buffer.
 - c. Only one driveway is allowed to access McCoy Road from the entire project, which has already been provided on the hospital site. As a result, no further driveways are allowed to access McCoy Road from the Raiford property.
 - d. Hotels are allowed by right on the property. However, the City Council specifically required residence hotels to have SUP review and approval to afford the City a final look at the concept and character to ensure a quality and sustainable product is provided, thus the current SUP case under consideration.
 - e. Building height is limited based upon proximity to McCoy Road. The Residence Inn site is restricted to six stories.
4. Subsequently, a portion of the property was sold to Lowen Holdings (the applicant) for 2 hotel developments (the Courtyard Marriott and Convention Center and the Hampton Inn Hilton). The Courtyard Marriott and Convention Center was constructed in 2016 and the Hampton Inn Hilton is currently in development review.
5. In August 2018, the City released a Request for Proposal (RFP) to select a hotel developer for a City-owned tract located to the immediate north of the Courtyard Marriott. It was expected that the development partner selected through the RFP process would operate within the existing development entitlements to develop a residence hotel, which requires a SUP.
6. According to Smith Travel Research (STR), a company which provides premium data benchmarking, analytics and marketplace insights for global hospitality sectors, the Residence Inn Marriott is classified as an Upscale hotel like the Courtyard Marriott to its south.
7. Residence Inn Marriott accommodates both corporate business and family leisure travelers.
8. To lessen a hotel's potential impact to the Nob Hill residents across McCoy Road, the City applied strict distancing requirements from McCoy Road, limiting driveway access onto

McCoy Road and directed buildings aligned with Raiford Road.

9. Apart from the Courtyard Marriott, all existing hotels and motels in Carrollton are not in conformance with current hotel regulations in the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance. These hotels and motels are considered economy hotels and are “grandfathered.” This hotel should not be confused with economy and budget hotels which do not provide the amenities or services the City requires today. This absence of amenities and services create a lower operating and maintenance cost to the hotel and, therefore, can provide a lower stay rate than upscale hotels.
10. The PD allows full-service and limited-service hotels by right on the subject tract without the need of a Special Use Permit. A Special Use Permit is only required for residence or extended stay type hotels.

PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION MEETING ON MAY 7, 2020

Nob Hill residents expressed privacy concerns related to hotel guests looking into the back yards of their homes, high traffic on McCoy Road, and drug and crime problems increasing. Staff provides the following responses to the public’s concerns:

1. Regarding hotel guests looking into the back yards of Nob Hill residents, staff visited the Courtyard Marriott and took a photo from the 6th floor. The photo is attached to this report and shows the difficulty of looking into the back yards of Nob Hill residents. Furthermore, the new residence hotel is adding 7 Live Oak trees, beyond the number of trees required in the Landscape Ordinance, along the eastern perimeter of their development site. This additional landscaping will further enhance their hotel and provide additional screening to the residents of Nob Hill.
2. The Transportation Engineering Manager reviewed the potential impact of the hotels in 2010 and concluded that the existing streets (including McCoy Road) should be able to handle the expected traffic generated from the planned development. Furthermore, the new hotel will have direct access from Raiford Road and not McCoy Road.
3. The Commission requested information regarding any complaints from the Courtyard Marriott and the economy hotel on Trinity Mills Road, as it relates to criminal activity increasing. The Carrollton Police Department indicated that there have not been any major criminal issues at the Carrollton Courtyard Marriott and do not anticipate the proposed Residence Inn Marriott to have the same types of crime issues as other long term stay hotels, such as economy and budget hotels.

PLANNING & ZONING COMMISSION MEETING ON JUNE 18, 2020

Ravi Shah, Director of Development Services presented a brief history of the 110-acre Raiford tract. After his presentation, Michael McCauley presented the applicant’s request for a Residence Hotel via SUP for the 4.6-acre site. Staff’s presentation was followed by the applicant’s presentation and then public comments from those participating in the telephonic meeting. After the Commission’s deliberation, a motion was made to approve the request, but the motion failed with a 4-5 vote.

On June 19, 2020, the applicant appealed the Commission's decision and requested their case be scheduled for hearing before the City Council on July 7, 2020. A favorable vote of three-fourth (3/4) of all members of the City Council is required to overrule the Planning & Zoning Commission's recommendation of denial.

CONCPETUAL BUILDING ELEVATIONS

The 6-story building's architecture is compatible with the adjoining Courtyard Marriott and provides a porte-cochere and contrast to the façade with variations to the roof heights. The building's footprint is approximately 21,700 square feet and is very similar to the Residence Inn Marriott located in Fairview, TX. The proposed residence hotel is consistent with the architecture proposed with the original hotel development concept plan.

CONCEPTUAL LANDSCAPE PLAN

The proposal exceeds the minimum required landscaping and does not encroach into the 100-foot conservation buffer. To further enhance its landscaping, the applicant has provided 7 additional Live Oak trees along its eastern perimeter adjacent to the conservation buffer in addition to the number of trees required by the PD.

CONCEPTUAL SITE PLAN

The hotel will provide a driveway onto Raiford Road and cross-access with the Courtyard Marriott to its immediate south. The building will face Raiford Road and be approximately 200 feet from the curb of McCoy Road. Furthermore, the proposal provides ample parking and screening.

CONCLUSION

Staff believes the proposal for this Residence Inn Marriott is consistent with the City's vision for the 31-acre tract. The hotel is designed in concert with the Courtyard Marriott and the Hampton Inn Hilton as part of a cohesive development. It has been the City's objective to create a high-quality hotel development on this tract. The applicant's proposal has met the City's expectation by exceeding the requirements in the PD and the requirements for a Residence Hotel under Article 21 Special Use Permits.