

**Excerpt from Draft Minutes
Planning & Zoning Commission
Meeting of June 18, 2020**

A meeting and work session of the City of Carrollton Planning & Zoning Commission were held on Thursday, June 18, 2020 at 7:00 p.m. by means of a telephonic meeting on Zoom.

Commission Members Present:

Chad Averett, Chair
Larry Kiser, Vice Chair
Mel Chadwick, 1st Vice Chair
Margot Diamond
John Powell
John Denholm
Kathryn Taylor
Tony Romo II
Sunil Sundaran

Commission Members Absent:

Staff Members Present:

Loren Shapiro, Planning Manager
Susan Keller, 1st Asst. City Attorney
Tom Hammons, Interim Dir. of Engineering
Herb Cavanaugh, Battalion Chief Prevention,
Fire Dept.
Ravi Shah, Director, Development Services

Michael McCauley, Senior Planner
Molly Coryell, Planner
John Romberger, Transportation Engineer
Edward Green, Plans Examiner
Lydia Tormos, Admin Support Specialist
Michael Bishop, Police Commander, Support
Services

*(Note: * = designation of a motion)*

4. Hold A Public Hearing To Consider An Ordinance Amending The Zoning To Establish A Special Use Permit For A Residence Hotel On An Approximately 4.6 Acre Tract Zoned PD-189 For The (O-4) Office District And Located Approximately 800 Feet North Of E. Trinity Mills Road, Between Raiford Road And McCoy Road; Amending The Official Zoning Map Accordingly. Case No. PLSUP 20-1X1 Residence Inn Carrollton. Case Coordinator: Michael McCauley.

Ravi Shah, Director of Development Services presented a brief history of the tract under review for the Residence Inn.

In 2008 the City purchased 110 acres for development, had a planning study completed to review the old zoning and recommend new zoning for the property., which became known as the Raiford Road project area. The *Villas at Raiford Road* project submitted plans for a 188-unit senior housing on Raiford Road.

In 2010, the City elected to sell a portion of the property, 31 acres, to *Lowen Holdings* and the western portion to *Arcadia Realty*, rezoned the southeastern portion of the property to allow for an eight-story hotel and two six-story hotels. Staff conducted four meetings with property owners and representatives of the Nob Hill Subdivision to discuss the vision for this 31-acre tract. A joint public hearing with the Planning & Zoning Commission and City Council was conducted with the presentation to accommodate office, hospitality and hotel uses, which included a proposal from the applicant for three internationally branded, high quality, upscale hotels (Courtyard Marriott, Hampton Inn Hilton and Residence Inn Marriott) aligned along Raiford Road.

In 2011, the City approved the contract to sell *Lowen Holdings* the hotel site with the urban design standards attached to the contract and the Planning & Zoning Commission heard a presentation on the development of the *Raiford Road Overlay Strategic Vision* and *Raiford Road Urban Design Standards*.

By 2020, the single-family housing development named Raiford Crossing, north of Furneaux Creek, and the Marriot Courtyard Hotel and Convention Center had been completed and a new mixed-use development, named The View, has been approved by Council and is currently under construction. So, the site continues to develop as planned.

Senior Planner McCauley presented the SUP and stated that this hotel will face Raiford Road, provide no driveway to McCoy Road and will not encroach into the 100-foot wide conservation buffer along McCoy Road. The applicant will be adding extra landscaping including seven additional Live Oak trees within the landscape buffer adjacent to the conservation buffer to help further screen the hotel from the adjoining neighborhood. He said apart from the Courtyard Marriott, all existing hotels and motels in Carrollton are not in conformance with current hotel regulations in the Comprehensive Zoning Ordinance. These hotels and motels are considered economy hotels and are “grandfathered.” This hotel should not be confused with economy and budget hotels which do not provide the amenities or services the City requires today. This absence of amenities and services create a lower operating and maintenance cost to the hotel and, therefore, can provide a lower stay rate than upscale hotels. The Residence Inn Marriott is classified as an Upscale hotel by Smith Travel Research which provides premium data benchmarking, analytics and marketplace insights for global hospitality sectors.

At the Commission meeting on June 4, public comments were received and some residents of the subdivision on the other side of McCoy expressed privacy concerns related to hotel guests looking into the back yards of their homes, high traffic on McCoy Road, and drug and crime problems increasing. The Commission requested information regarding any complaints from the Courtyard Marriott and the economy hotel on Trinity Mills Road, as it relates to criminal activity increasing.

Staff provided the following responses to the public’s concerns:

1. Regarding hotel guests looking into the back yards of Nob Hill residents, staff visited the Courtyard Marriott and took a photo from the 6th floor. The photo is attached to this report and shows the difficulty of looking into the back yards of Nob Hill residents. Furthermore, the new residence hotel is adding 7 Live Oak trees, beyond the number of trees required in the Landscape Ordinance, along the eastern perimeter of their development site. This additional landscaping will further enhance their hotel and

provide additional screening to the residents of Nob Hill.

2. The Transportation Engineering Manager reviewed the potential impact of the hotels in 2010 and concluded that the existing streets (including McCoy Road) should be able to handle the expected traffic generated from the planned development. Furthermore, the new hotel will have direct access from Raiford Road and not McCoy Road.
3. The Carrollton Police Department indicated that there have not been any major criminal issues at the Carrollton Courtyard Marriott and do not anticipate the proposed Residence Inn Marriott to have the same types of crime issues as other long term stay hotels, such as economy and budget hotels.

In conclusion, Staff believes the proposal for this Residence Inn Marriott is consistent with the City's vision for the 31-acre tract. The hotel is designed in concert with the Courtyard Marriott and the Hampton Inn Hilton as part of a cohesive development. It has been the City's objective to create a high-quality hotel development on this tract. The applicant's proposal has met the City's expectation by exceeding the requirements in the PD and the requirements for a Residence Hotel under Article 21 Special Use Permits. Therefore, staff recommends approval with stipulations.

Sanjay Naik and Ajay Desai, with Lowen Hospitality Management, Grapevine; James Lusty, Architect with Point-Six, 300 E. Abram St., Suite 150 Arlington, TX; and Ron Stewart, Vice-President of Development for Marriott, Plano, shared a PowerPoint detailing the history of the Marriott brand and the Lowen Holdings family. Lusty explained they designed the hotel to be located as far away as possible from McCoy Road with public areas on the Raiford Road side and the private areas, the rooms, facing McCoy Road. Stewart explained that the term extended stay refers to staying five or more days in the same hotel. Ones needing an extended stay may be those on vacation, family members supporting someone undergoing medical treatment, company employees relocating to the area and need a place to stay until they find their permanent residence, or if someone's home has suffered major damage and will stay while repairs are made. Residence Inn overall has an occupancy rate of 80% and average cost of \$145.00 per night. The rewards program actually drives much of the booking of their hotels while they charge more a night.

Kiser inquired about the occupancy rate of the neighboring Courtyard, if the Residence Inn would have a full-service hotel and what size the trees to be planted will be. Desai said pre-Covid-19, Courtyard had a 70 percent occupancy, it would not have a full-service restaurant while McCauley stated the Landscape Ordinance requires three-inch caliber trees.

Taylor stated the adjoining neighborhood had a great concern of what the impact financially will be on their property values. Desai said they will be spending \$20-25 million in constructing the hotel and believes having such a large investment would not hurt the property values.

Denholm wanted to address the concern about increased traffic on McCoy Road. John Romberger, Transportation Engineer said the TIA study covered the traffic at that time and the future development planned and that found the surrounding streets could handle the expected traffic. He reminded everyone there would not be additional openings onto McCoy Road and any hotel traffic exiting through the hospital's entrance would most likely be traveling south one block to gain access onto George Bush. Denholm also asked how close the nearest neighbor was. Desai said 240 feet. Denholm asked if the hotel ownership changed and if the hotel began to deteriorate what

recourse would be available. McCauley said any SUP can be brought back to the Commission for revaluation if considered necessary or code enforcement could step in.

After a short recess, the Chair opened the meeting to any public comments.

The following spoke during the public hearing in opposition to the project:

Lynda El-Mandouh, 2711 Lookout Pl.
Melonie Hoy, 1603 Reunion Cir.
Philip Owen, 1600 Reunion Cir.
Shanoor Ashraf, 1601 Bennington Dr.
Margaret O'Conner, 1610 Reunion Cir.
Tommy Stewert, 1606 Railhead Pl.
Roberta Stovely, 2707 Spyglass
Laurie Foster, 1806 Crestview Dr.
Ivan Diaz DeLeon, 1613 Railhead Pl.
Marilyn Hays, 1625 Black Stone
Adam Polter, 4180 Creek Hollow Dr.
Karen McNally, 1607 Railhead Pl.
Thomas Verney, 1604 Reunion Cir.
Danny Boudrot, 2814 Crooked Creek Dr.
John Godbey, 1642 Crooked Creek Dr.
Sarah Ferry Nunn, 1601 Railhead Pl.
Kathryn Roberts, 1603 Sutters Mill Pl.
Al Overholt, 2216 Ridgewood
Karim Kara, 1648 Black Stone Dr.
Mo El-Mandouh, 2711 Lookout Pl.
Albert Aragon, 1609 Sutters Mill Pl.
Tanya Kuhlo, 3001 Cemetery Hill Rd.

The following spoke in support of the project:
Doug Hrbacek, 1406 N. Main St.

Chadwick stated he likes Residence Inn but will be listening to the neighbors and vote against the case. Denholm asked for clarification on the required setbacks long McCoy Rd. and after learning the project meets the setback he would be voting in favor. Sunil said he was in support of the project. Kiser said he did not think this was in the right location and would be voting against it. Romo said he supports what staff presented.

- * ***Denholm moved to close the public hearing and approve Case No. PLSUP 2020-1X1 Residence Inn, second by Sundaran and the motion failed with a unanimous 4-5 vote (Denholm, Romo, Sundaran and Averett for; Taylor, Diamond, Chadwick, Kiser and Powell opposed).***